



Sector Wide Impact Assessment

Myanmar Tourism Sector Wide Impact Assessment



Rick Senley

THE DANISH
INSTITUTE FOR
HUMAN RIGHTS

Myanmar Centre for
Responsible Business

Institute for
Human Rights and Business

The Myanmar Centre for Responsible Business (MCRB) was set up in 2013 by the Institute for Human Rights and Business (IHRB) and the Danish Institute for Human Rights (DIHR) with funding from several donor governments. Based in Yangon, it aims to provide a trusted and impartial platform for the creation of knowledge, capacity, and dialogue amongst businesses, civil society organizations and governments to encourage responsible business conduct throughout Myanmar. Responsible business means business conduct that works for the long-term interests of Myanmar and its people, based on responsible social and environmental performance within the context of international standards.

© **Copyright Myanmar Centre for Responsible Business (MCRB), Danish Institute for Human Rights (DIHR) and Institute for Human Rights and Business (IHRB), February 2015.**

Published by MCRB, DIHR and IHRB.

All rights reserved. MCRB, DIHR and IHRB permit free reproduction of extracts from this publication provided that due acknowledgment is given and a copy of the publication carrying the extract is sent to the headquarter addresses below. Requests for permission to reproduce and translate the publication should be addressed to MCRB, DIHR and IHRB.

Danish Institute for Human Rights (DIHR)

Wilders Plads 8K
1403 Copenhagen K
Email:
info@humanrights.dk
Web: www.humanrights.dk

Myanmar Centre for Responsible Business

15 Shan Yeiktha Street
Sanchaung, Yangon,
Myanmar
Email: info@myanmar-responsiblebusiness.org
Web: www.myanmar-responsiblebusiness.org
or www.mcrb.org.mm

Institute for Human Rights and Business (IHRB)

34b York Way
London, N1 9AB
United Kingdom
Email: info@ihrb.org
Web: www.ihrb.org



Acknowledgements

The partner organizations would like to thank the Governments of Denmark, Ireland, Netherlands, Norway, Switzerland and United Kingdom for their on-going support to MCRB.



The partner organizations would also like to thank all those who participated in the field assessments across Myanmar, and in the August 2014 consultations on the draft SWIA report, as well as those who participated in the webinar on the draft tourism SWIA report in October 2014. They also thank the Union Government, as well as the Governments of Ayeyarwady Division, Mandalay Region, Mon State, Shan State and Yangon Region for their support in the research phase.

Particular thanks are also due to Nicole Hausler, Paul Rogers, Achim Munz (Hanns Seidel Foundation) and Andrea Valentin (Tourism Transparency) for their valuable input throughout the process and PeaceNexus Foundation for their support and comments on the conflict dimensions of the drafts.

The report was written by: Tulika Bansal and Elin Wrzoncki of DIHR, Donna Guest of IHRB, together with Vicky Bowman and Thi Thi Thein of MCRB, with important contributions from Margaret Wachenfeld and Haley St. Dennis of IHRB, Catie Shavin (external consultant) and Allan Lerberg Jørgensen (DIHR). Research support was provided by Salome Zurabishvili, Mette Marstrard-Jørgensen, Camilla Andersen and Anouk Siedler, DIHR interns. The research also draws on background papers developed for MCRB by Delphia Lim and Ross Wilson.

The team would also like to recognise the contributions of the MCRB Tourism field team: Research Leader Khaing Oo Shwe and researchers: Maw Li Win, Hnin Marlar Phyu, Thant Zaw Win, Yi Yi Lynn Thant, Su Su Hlaing and Myo Naing, as well as Ashley Pritchard, who provided valuable input during the field research phase. Lastly, Polina Lenkova, summer intern at MCRB, conducted research on tourism in ethnic areas which was used for this report.

Contents

List of Abbreviations	5
List of Terms	6
List of Boxes, Tables and Figures	7
Executive Summary	9
PART 1: INTRODUCTION	17
PART 2: GOVERNMENT LEGAL AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK	29
PART 3: SECTOR-LEVEL IMPACTS	68
3.1 Tourism in Ethnic Minority Areas	92
PART 4: CUMULATIVE AND PROJECT-LEVEL IMPACTS	99
4.1 Stakeholder Engagement & Grievance Mechanisms	105
4.2 Community Impacts	116
4.3 Land	123
4.4 Labour	137
4.5 Groups at Risk	150
4.6 Culture	165
4.7 Physical Security	173
4.8 Environment & Ecosystem Services	177
PART 5: RECOMMENDATIONS	189
5.1 Recommendations to the Government of Myanmar	191
5.2 Recommendations to Myanmar and Foreign Businesses	199
5.3 Recommendations to Institutional Investors	206
5.4 Recommendations to Tourists	207
5.5 Recommendations to Civil Society Organizations	208
5.6 Recommendations to Development Partners and Home Governments	209
5.7 Recommendations to the Myanmar National Human Rights Commission	211
5.8 Recommendation for All Stakeholder Groups	212
ANNEXES	214
Annex A: Additional Information on SWIA Methodology	215
Annex B: Tourist Survey Findings	228

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ASEAN	Association of South-East Asian Nations
BTA	British Travel Association
CBSTP	Central Body for Suppression of Trafficking in Persons
CEP	Core Environment Programme
CIL	Citizens Investment Law
CIT	Community Involvement in Tourism
COMMIT	Coordinated Mekong Ministerial Initiative against Trafficking
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DICA	Directorate for Investment
DMO	Destination Management Organisation
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ESIA	Environmental and Social Impact Assessments
FIL	Foreign Investment Law
FIR	Foreign Investment Rules
GMS	Greater Mekong Sub-region
IDP	Internally Displaced People
IEE	Initial Environmental Examination
IFC	International Finance Corporation
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ITC	International Trade Centre
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
KNU	Karen National Union
LAUSC	Land Allotment and Utilisation Scrutiny Committee
MCEA	Myanmar Construction Entrepreneurs Association
MHA	Myanmar Hoteliers Association
MIC	Myanmar Investment Commission
MNCWA	Myanmar National Committee for Women's Affairs
MNHRC	Myanmar National Human Rights Commission
MOECA	Ministry of Environmental Conservation and Forestry
MoHT	Ministry of Hotels and Tourism
MRA	Myanmar Restaurant Association
MRTP	Myanmar Responsible Tourism Policy
MTF	Myanmar Tourism Federation
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NLD	National League for Democracy
NMSP	New Mon State Party
NSAGs	Non-state armed groups
NWCD	Nature and Wildlife Conservation Division
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PATA	Pacific Asian Travel Association
SAZ	Self Administered Zone
SIA	Social Impact Assessment
SLORC	State Law and Order Restoration Council
SNDP	Shan Nationalities Democratic Party
SWIA	Sector-Wide Impact Assessment
UMTA	Union of Myanmar Travel Association
UNGPs	UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights
WBG	World Bank Group

TERMS

Amyotha Hluttaw: The “House of Nationalities”, which is the Upper House of the National Legislature and has 224 representatives – 168 are elected in equal numbers from each Region and State, i.e. 12 representatives from each Region or State. The 12 must include one elected representative from each Self-Administered Division or each Self-Administered Zone. 56 representatives are nominated by the Commander-in-Chief of the Defence Services, including 4 representatives from each Region or State. (Constitution of the Republic of the Union of Myanmar (2008), Article 141)

Constitution: The 2008 Constitution of the Republic of the Union of Myanmar which came into operation on the day the first session of the Pyidaungsu Hluttaw was convened (31 January 2011).

Hluttaw: A Burmese equivalent of “legislature.” Myanmar has a National (Union) Hluttaw, and Hluttaws in each State and Region.

Pyidaungsu Hluttaw: The National (Union) Legislature, which is bicameral and composed of the Amyotha Hluttaw and the Pyithu Hluttaw.

Pyithu Hluttaw: The “House of Representatives” or the “People’s Assembly”, which is the Lower House of the National Legislature and has 440 representatives. 330 representatives are elected from township-based constituencies. 110 representatives are nominated by the Commander-in-Chief of the Defence Services. (Constitution, Article 109)

Tatmadaw: The Tatmadaw refers to the armed forces of the Union of Myanmar. The main armed force is the Defence Services, and all armed forces in the Union are under the command of the Defence Services. (Constitution, Articles 337 and 338)

Union Government: The Union Government comprises the President, the two Vice-Presidents, the Ministers of the Union, and the Attorney-General of the Union. (Constitution, Article 200)

LIST OF BOXES, TABLES AND FIGURES

Box 1: Recommendations from the OECD as part of the Myanmar Investment Policy Review Chapter on Responsible Business Conduct	23
Box 2: The Corporate Responsibility to Respect Human Rights	25
Box 3: Business Relationships in the Tourism Sector	25
Box 4: SWIA Mitigation Hierarchy	27
Box 5: SWIA – Three Levels of Impact	28
Box 6: Constitutional Rights of Citizens and Non-Citizens	36
Box 7: Existing Non-Judicial Grievance Mechanisms	39
Box 8: Myanmar’s Accession to International Human Rights and Labour Instruments	40
Box 9: The Myanmar Foreign Investment Law, Citizens Investment Law and Human Rights	43
Box 10: Further Legal Frameworks Relevant to Tourism: Environment, Land and Labour	53
Box 11: Main Objectives of the Six Strategic Programmes of the Tourism Master Plan	61
Figure 1: Myanmar Visitors Forecast 2013-2020	70
Table 1: Projected Tourism Arrivals and Spend, 2015-2020	71
Figure 2: Tourism Value Chain	71
Table 2: Estimated Direct Tourism Employment in Myanmar, 2012-2020	78
Box 12: Case Study: Benefit Sharing of Tourism Revenues in Mount Emei, China	79
Box 13: Case Study: Vocational Training and Education in the Tourism Sector	87
Box 14: Case Study: Tourism and Water Scarcity in Bali, Indonesia	89
Box 15: Case Study: Conflict-Assessment in Angola by Swiss Tour Operator	96
Box 16: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Conflict Sensitivity	98
Box 17: Human Rights Concerns Regarding Cumulative Impacts	102
Box 18: Relevant International Guidance on Cumulative Impacts	104
Box 19: Case Study: Participation of Local Leaders in Tourism Development	106
Box 20: Case Study: Stakeholder Engagement and Transparency in the Tourism Sector	110
Box 21: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Stakeholder Engagement and Grievance Mechanisms	111
Box 22: Case Study: Community-Owned Tourism Organization in Belize	117
Box 23: Case Study: Community Participation in Tourism Policy	118
Box 24: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Community Impacts	121
Box 25: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Land	136
Box 26: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Labour	149
Box 27: Case Study: Addressing Sex Tourism in Nosy Be, Madagascar	157
Box 28: Case Study: ChildSafe Tourism Campaign, Cambodia	159
Box 29: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Groups at Risk	164
Box 30: Case Study: Raising Awareness to Houseboat Tourists, Kerala, India	166
Box 31: Protection and Preservation of Cultural Heritage Regions Law	167
Box 32: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Culture	171
Box 33: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Security	176
Box 34: Case Study: Natma Taung National Park	180

Box 35: Relevant International Standards and Guidance on Environment and Ecosystem Services	188
Box 36: Case Study: Roundtable on Human Rights in Tourism	213
ANNEXES	
Box 37: SWIA Phases	215
Box 38: Six Key Criteria for Assessing Human Rights Impacts	218
Box 39: Topics Covered in SWIA Questionnaires	222
Box 40: Stakeholder Interviews Conducted	223